

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Right to Conscientious Objection and Duty to Disobey	1
1.2	Road to Peace: Conscientious Objection as a Means of Achieving Peace.....	4
1.3	Crisis of Conscription: Decline of the Authority of States	8
1.4	Volunteer Soldiers and Conscientious Objection	9
1.5	Absolute Conscientious Objection and Selective Conscientious Objection	10
1.6	Conscientious Objection and Civil Disobedience	12
1.6.1	General Distinction	12
1.6.2	Legal Philosophers' View	13
1.6.3	Objections to Conscientious Objection	13
1.7	Concluding Remarks.....	14
	References	15
2	Right to Conscientious Objection in the United Nations Human Rights Law	19
2.1	United Nations Human Rights Norms.....	20
2.1.1	Activities Before 1970	21
2.1.2	Travaux Préparatoires of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	22
2.1.3	NGO Initiatives from the Late 60s	29
2.1.4	Discussion Before the Third Committee of the General Assembly in 1970	30
2.1.5	Resolution 11 B (XXVII) of 1971 by the Commission on Human Rights	33
2.1.6	The Secretary-General's Activities Following Resolution 11 B (XXVII) of 1971	38
2.1.7	General Assembly Resolution 33/165 of 1978	40
2.1.8	Report on Conscientious Objection Prepared by the Sub-Commission of 1984.....	42

2.1.9	Draft Resolution of 1985 by the Commission on Human Rights	45
2.1.10	Resolution 1987/46 by the Commission on Human Rights ..	48
2.1.11	Resolution 1989/59 by the Commission on Human Rights ..	50
2.1.12	Convention on the Rights of the Child of 1989	51
2.1.13	Report by Special Rapporteur of 1992	55
2.1.14	Resolution 1993/84 by the Commission on Human Rights ..	55
2.1.15	General Comment by the Human Rights Committee of 1993	56
2.1.16	Resolutions Following Resolution 1993/84 of the Commission on Human Rights	61
2.1.17	Study of the Issue of the Administration of Justice Through Military Tribunals of 2005	66
2.2	Enforcement Mechanism	67
2.2.1	Individual Communication and Evolving Interpretation of the Covenant	67
2.2.2	Yeo-Bum Yoon and Myung-Jin Choi V Republic of Korea ..	70
2.2.3	Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties Under Article 40 of the Covenant	74
2.3	Concluding Remarks	80
	References	81
3	Right to Conscientious Objection in European Human Rights Law ..	83
3.1	European Human Rights Norms	84
3.1.1	Drafting the European Convention on Human Rights	84
3.1.2	Silence of the Travaux Préparatoires of the European Convention on Human Rights with Respect to Conscientious Objection	88
3.1.3	Resolutions by the Council of Europe	88
3.1.4	Charter of Fundamental Rights of European Union	94
3.2	The European Commission of Human Rights and the European Court of Human Rights	95
3.2.1	Earlier Individual Petitions	96
3.2.2	Individual Petitions Arguing Violation of Prohibition of Discrimination	100
3.2.3	Individual Petitions Arguing Violation of Prohibition of Degrading Treatment	101
3.2.4	European Committee of Social Rights	103
3.3	Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe	104
3.3.1	Greek Practice	105
3.3.2	Finnish Practice	106
3.4	Concluding Remarks	109
	References	109

4	Inter-American Human Rights Law	111
4.1	Inter-American Human Rights Institutions – an Unsettled Position .	112
4.2	Concluding Remarks	118
	References	118
5	International Refugee Law and Conscientious Objection	119
5.1	Conscientious Objector as Asylum Seeker	119
5.2	Thresholds for Conscientious Objector as Asylum Seeker	121
5.3	State Practice	124
5.3.1	The Krotov Case	125
5.3.2	Hinzman Case	127
5.3.3	Position of Refugee Status Appeals Authority of New Zealand	129
5.3.4	Iranian Selective Conscientious Objector in Time of Peace .	130
5.3.5	European Union Qualification Directive	131
5.4	Conscientious Objection to Military Service Itself as Ground for Asylum	133
5.5	Concluding Remarks	133
	References	135
6	Defence of Superior Orders: Duties of Individuals to Disobey Manifestly Illegal Orders under International Law	137
6.1	Defence of Superior Orders and Duties of Individuals	137
6.2	History of Defence of Superior Orders Under International Law .	139
6.3	Main Theories of the Defence of Superior Orders	155
6.3.1	Doctrine of Respondeat Superior	155
6.3.2	Doctrine of Absolute Liability	156
6.3.3	Conditional Liability Approach: Manifest Illegality Principle	157
6.3.4	Doctrine of Mitigation Factor	158
6.3.5	Doctrine of Justification and Excuse	159
6.3.6	Observation on Theories of Defence of Superior Orders .	161
6.4	Criminality and Illegality of International Wrongful Act	163
6.4.1	Genocide	163
6.4.2	Apartheid	168
6.4.3	Aggression	173
6.4.4	Crimes Against Humanity and War Crimes	176
6.5	Concluding Observation	178
	References	179
7	Impacts of <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> and <i>Jus In Bello</i> on Rights and Duties of Individuals to Disobey Manifestly Illegal Orders	183
7.1	On the Distinction between <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> and <i>Jus In Bello</i>	183
7.2	History of <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> and <i>Jus In Bello</i>	185
7.3	Relationships between <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> and <i>Jus In Bello</i>	187

7.4	Belligerent Equality	189
7.5	Moralists' Views on Belligerent Equality	190
7.6	In Defence of Belligerent Equality	192
7.7	The Case of Concurrence of <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> Violation and <i>Jus In Bello</i> Violation	194
7.7.1	Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons	194
7.7.2	Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory	196
7.8	Duties of Individuals Derived from <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>	196
7.9	State Practice of Conscientious Objector Based on <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i> ..	200
7.10	Religious Views	204
7.11	Concluding Remarks	205
	References	205
8	Conclusion	207
8.1	Towards an Approach of Complementary Rights and Duties	207
8.2	Status of Individuals Under International Law	208
8.3	Duties of Individuals to the Community Under International Law ..	210
8.4	Article 29(1) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	210
8.5	Meanings of Duty and Community	215
8.6	Conscience of Mankind	216
8.7	In Search of Pragmatic Solutions	218
	References	224
	Bibliography	227
	Index	247